

Evaluating the effectiveness of the Nal'ibali Reading for Enjoyment Campaign Supplements

Submitted to Nal'ibali

26 September 2018 Authors: Susan Stine, Eleanor Hazell and Kelly Shiohira



RESEARCH IMPLEMENTATION MONITORING & EVALUATION

Executive Summary

Introduction

Nal'ibali is a **campaign** which aims to spark children's potential through storytelling and reading, and build a culture of reading for enjoyment in South Africa. Although the campaign aims to reach people of all classes, races, and age groups, the primary target group is adults who live and work with children, and are, or have the potential to become, reading role models. The following values and beliefs, underpinned by a body of knowledge and experience (discussed in Chapter 1), undergird the campaign:

- Acquisition of literacy is a social and cultural process, with associated wide-ranging benefits from enjoyment to learning and emotional and personal development.
- Adults can play a key role in nurturing a love for reading by reading aloud to, and encouraging, children to read for pleasure.
- Literacy practices within the home can prepare children for reading and learning at school, but there may be tensions between home and school literacy practices.
- Children who learn to read confidently in their mother tongue will have a solid foundation for reading in all languages and are more likely to do well in school and in life.
- South African households face significant challenges with regards to access to reading materials (particularly in African languages).

Nal'ibali produces a bilingual reading supplement every two weeks during term time. All language versions include English and a second language. The languages the supplement is produced in currently include: Afrikaans, isiXhosa, isiZulu, Sepedi, Sesotho, Setswana, and Xitsonga (the latter two were introduced in 2018 after this evaluation of the effectiveness of the Nal'ibali supplements commenced). The supplements are distributed via three main channels: 1) via Tiso Blackstar (TB) newspapers (Sunday World, Sunday Times Express, the Daily Dispatch, and the Herald); 2) delivered to reading clubs and other organisations via TB distributors and by courier to outlying rural areas; and 3) via the South African Post Office (SAPO).

Approach and methodology

Nal'ibali commissioned JET Education Services (JET) to undertake a **formative** evaluation to ascertain effectiveness with specific focus on the bilingual reading supplement. The following questions guided the study:

Thematic area	Evaluation questions
Targeting	Who are the different audiences of the supplement (e.g. geographic location, race,
	sex, age, home language, additional languages spoken, socio-economic status)?
	How are the supplements accessed by different audiences?
	How well-targeted are the various distribution channels?
	What % of the supplements distributed by TB is read?
	What % of the supplements distributed by TB is used in other ways?
	 How many people are the supplements distributed to Nal'ibali subscribers read by and used by?
	 Would Nal'ibali readers/users be able to access Nal'ibali through other distribution channels?
	 Would Nal'ibali readers/users prefer to receive the supplements via other distribution channels?
Use	How do different audiences use the supplement?
	How are the supplements used in different settings?
	How are the different language versions of the supplements used by different audiences?
	How are different sections of the supplement used by different audiences?
	Are adults reading stories aloud to children?
	Are the supplements contributing to frequent reading?
	Are the supplements contributing to the enjoyment of reading?
	Are the supplements being photocopied, recycled (passed on to others), kept, or
	thrown away?
Appropriateness	Are the supplements enjoyed by people of different age groups?
	How do the supplements compare to other reading materials in terms of preference?
	 How do the supplements compare to other reading materials in terms of frequency and type of use?
	Which sections of the supplements do different readers/users enjoy the most and least?
	 Which sections of the supplements are read/used the most, and least, by different audiences?
Quality	Does anecdotal positive feedback about the 'cut-out-and-keep' stories hold true across a more rigorous sample of supplement users?
	Are the stories engaging and enjoyed by different audiences?
	Are users satisfied with the quality of the translations?
	Are users satisfied with the quality of the (newspaper/magazine) materials?
	How long do the supplements last?
Messaging	Do key messages in the supplements resonate with people's values?
	Do people find key messages in the supplements inspiring and motivational?
	What are people's understanding of, attitudes towards, and practices in terms of
	reading for enjoyment?
	What value do people place on reading for enjoyment wrt reading for other
	purposes?
	 What are people's attitudes towards, and practices, in terms of reading with children?
Cost-	How cost-effective are the different distribution strategies (delivery, SAPO, TB
effectiveness	newspaper publication)?
	What is the cost per reader/user of the different distribution strategies?
	How does the cost-effectiveness of the supplements compare to other Nal'ibali
	reading materials?

A **mixed methods** design was utilised. The main quantitative methodology was a **survey** conducted with different groups of Nal'ibali supplement users and prospective users, and a shorter survey conducted with a 'comparison group' of reading clubs reported to not receive the supplement. Where possible, probability sampling methods were used in order to draw a sample representative of the broader population, and to generate findings which would be generalisable. However, this was not possible in the case of TB newspaper purchasers (TBP) due to cost and logistical constraints. The surveys were conducted telephonically, except in the case of TBPs who were surveyed in situ. The table below summarises the various survey samples:

Respondent type	Population	Sample	Target # respondents	Actual # respondents
Nal'ibali supplement subscribing organisations (SOs): Nal'ibali provided a database of organisations with a current subscription to the Nal'ibali supplement.	741	741	253	246
Non-subscribing organisations (NSOs (reading clubs)): Nal'ibali provided a database of NSOs, which was their database of registered reading clubs that did not appear on the SO list ¹ .	1 092	947	284	311
TB newspaper subscribers (TBSs): A database of subscribers to the TB newspapers Sunday World, the Daily Dispatch, and the Herald was provided by TB and a random sample was drawn.	13 283	1 119	380	402
TB newspaper ad-hoc purchasers (TBP): Fieldwork was conducted outside retail outlets in three provinces where TB newspapers containing the supplements are sold: Eastern Cape (EC) (Daily	38 230 copies sold (EC); 45 782	N/A	380;	484;
Dispatch & the Herald), Gauteng (GP) (Sunday World), and Limpopo (LP) (Sunday World).	copies sold (GP);		381;	419;
	3 015 copies sold (LP)		341	400
Total	N/A	N/A	2 019	2 262

The qualitative methods utilised were interviews and focus group discussions (FGD). Key informant interviews were conducted with individuals from Nal'ibali and partner organisations, while semi-structured interviews were conducted to gain insight into two supplement distribution channels. FGDs were facilitated with adult and child supplement users to explore values, attitudes, and behaviours – particularly relating to Nal'ibali messaging.

A cost analysis was also conducted.

¹ We refer to these organisations as NSOs rather than reading clubs, as during the course of the survey we asked these organisations whether they had a reading club and not all of them did. Many SOs did have reading clubs. As these organisations are generally referred to by Nal'ibali as 'reading clubs', they will be referred to throughout this report as 'NSOs (reading clubs)'.

Survey respondent demographics

The respondents were from all **provinces**, with the majority being located in the Eastern Cape, Gauteng, and Limpopo - the provinces where TBP surveys were conducted, which accounted for over 50% of all respondents. The representation of **population groups** of survey respondents is similar to that of the country as a whole. However, the TBS survey has a larger share of white respondents, and a smaller share of black (African) respondents. TBSs are more likely to be older (74% are aged 50+) and TBPs are more likely to be younger (56% are aged 18-39) than the general population.

Home language speakers of all 11 official South African languages were represented in the survey, but isiXhosa, Sepedi, and English home language speakers were over-represented, because: 1) the TBP survey was conducted in provinces where these languages are common, and 2) 41% of TBS were English home language speakers. While 12% of respondents reported English to be their home language, 85% reported it to be an additional language.

Survey respondents are better **educated** than the average South African and are less likely to be **unemployed**. The majority of organisational respondents identified themselves as working in education, or at non-governmental organisations (NGOs). The majority of TBS respondents identified themselves as parents/caregivers; however, the majority also reported living in a household with no children, which may because they are parents of adult children (given their age profile). The majority of TBP respondents did not identify as having any organisational or educational affiliations, but 33% reported being parents/caregivers.

Although all NSOs had previously registered with Nal'ibali as having a reading club, only 79% reported having an active reading club.

Access to reading materials

Number of books in the home has been confirmed as a strong predictor of academic success. TBS, and, to a lesser extent, TBP respondents, have considerably more books than the average South African household: a national survey found that just 7% of South Africans live in households with more than 10 books (SABDC, 2016), whereas 71% of the TBS respondents and 27% of TBP respondents reported doing so.

Almost all respondents who reported having books, have English language books (97%) in their homes/organisations. Fewer (55%) of respondents have books in the same language as their home language when this is not English, though this percentage was higher for organisational respondents (81% of SOs and 74% of NSOs (reading clubs) and NSROs. The majority of NSOs confirmed having reading material in the languages they wanted. However, 86% reported not receiving new reading material regularly. The main challenges relating to accessing new reading resources were cost and knowing where to get them. In this context the Nal'ibali bilingual reading supplement is fulfilling an important need.

SOs have better access to almost all types of reading resources than NSOs (reading clubs) and NSROs. The majority (57%) of SOs have more than 100 books in their organisations. SOs reported relatively high internet access (59%) as compared to NSOs (reading clubs) at 32%. Despite this, NSOs (reading clubs) and NSROs with internet access are more likely to read the Nal'ibali supplement online and download it.

Key findings and discussion

Awareness

Awareness of Nal'ibali was greater among TBSs (74%) than TBPs (57%), and 4% more TBP respondents reported having seen the Nal'ibali supplement than stated they were aware of Nal'ibali. Awareness was higher amongst TBPs in Gauteng and Limpopo as compared to the Eastern Cape.

Amongst organisations, attending training, attending events and word of mouth are the most common ways that NSOs (reading clubs) and NSROs are aware of Nal'ibali and would therefore seem to be the most effective awareness strategies.

Access and targeting

NSOs (reading clubs) were identified as a comparison group for SOs. However, a substantive 43% reported that they currently receive the supplement and a further 16% had received it in the past. NSOs (reading clubs) that reported receiving the supplement regularly were treated as a separate sub-group - i.e. non-subscribing organisations that receive the Nal'ibali supplement regularly (NSROs) – where relevant, with respect to analysis.

The vast majority (97%) of NSOs (reading clubs) reported that they would like to receive the supplement regularly, which begs the question – how do organisations become SOs? Evidence suggests that the current SOs are better resourced than organisations which are not SOs but would like to be.

The supplement is accessed via four modalities: 1) via a newspaper, 2) direct delivery to an SO, 3) delivery to a central distribution point which SOs collect from, and 4) delivery to a post office which SOs collect from and which members of the public collect the supplement from. In 2017 the majority of supplements 58%) were accessed via modality 1 and 42% were accessed via modalities 2, 3 and 4 (Nal'ibali, 2018).

The majority of SOs and NSROs indicated that they were 'very happy' with how they currently receive the supplement. When asked what ways were convenient for them to receive the supplement, 93% requested direct delivery to their organisation. Only respondents currently receiving the supplement via central distribution points and SAPOs indicated that these modalities were convenient, and no respondents indicated that collection from a library, shop, or buying a newspaper containing the supplement would be convenient. It would be difficult to change the delivery modality of organisations used to receiving the supplement directly to a more indirect modality but this could be phased in over time (i.e. as the list of SOs is updated).

The vast majority of TBS and TBP respondents said they would buy the newspaper regardless of whether the Nal'ibali supplement was in it. However, 28% of TBPs said they would prefer to receive it in another newspaper. A substantial 53% of TBPs in Limpopo would prefer to receive the supplement in another newspaper. The most preferred alternative newspapers were: the Daily Sun, City Press, The Sowetan, The Sunday Times and the Sunday World.

25% of TBPs and 14% of TBSs who were aware of the supplement would buy it if it was sold separately and the majority of those who would consider buying it would be willing to pay R5. Willingness to purchase the supplement is high in Limpopo: a substantial 47% of Limpopo TBPs said they would be willing to purchase the supplement if it were sold separately.

SAPO staff and central distribution point coordinators were less certain about whether people would or could pay for the supplement. There were concerns that people and organisations who benefit the most would not be able to afford it.

No real concerns were raised regarding the delivery of supplements by TB to organisations including SAPOs, but the majority of SAPO staff interviewed were unaware of SOs collecting the supplement from their post offices. Central distribution point coordinators mentioned challenges with SOs collecting the supplement, receiving too many supplements, and preferring to receive supplements in another language. They reported having raised and being unable to resolve these issues with Nal'ibali.

Use

For every 100 supplements distributed in newspapers to TBSs, 19 are used (by 41 people) and 31 are given away (2 of these are used and then given away). For every 100 supplements distributed to TBPs, 18 are used (by 47 people) and 10 are given away (1 of these is used and then given away). A far larger proportion (94% of SOs and 76% of NSROs) use the supplement, and a further 5% of SOs and 6% of NSROs give the supplement away. Organisations also have a higher number of people using the supplements; however, they typically receive multiple copies of the supplement.

Use of the supplement in organisations is high, even in NSOs and NSROs. For SOs, 90% of all respondents reported that "adults read to children", 88% reported that "adults and children read together", and 84% that "adults and children do activities together". Usage rates reported by NSOs and NSROs were 13 to 26 percentage points lower. Adult only use of the supplement is also high. "Adults read" was the most frequent use of the supplement by TBSs. The majority (68%) of adults who report use of the supplement in their home or organisation read the supplement. This rate is similar across organisations and TBSs.

'Reading aloud to children' was the most common use of the Nal'ibali supplements in SOs, whilst 'doing activities' was most common in NSOs (reading clubs) and NSROs and 'reading for enjoyment' was the most common use by TBSs and TBPs. 'Children reading on their own' is happening in 76% of SOs which have copies of the Nal'ibali supplement, which is higher than for other types of reading materials (reported in Chapter 4). There is some evidence to suggest that organisations which receive the Nal'ibali supplement without being an SO or receiving additional support make less effective use of the supplement, as they engage in fewer reading activities (in particular, reading to children and lending materials to children). SOs are more likely than NSOs (reading clubs) and NSROs to allow children to take the supplement home and when children take the supplement home SOs are more likely to allow them to keep it.

The supplement is predominantly used in English; it is used more extensively in other languages by organisations and when adults read to children.

The varied content included in the supplement is appreciated and used. All sections of the supplement are popular (except to a lesser extent the article on page one and get story active). 'Cut-out-and-keep' books are the most used section of the supplement, followed by the 'Story Corner' stories. Adults and children often make the 'cut-out-and-keep books' together. Organisations rarely throw the supplement away, and could be prime targets for anthologies (of which Nal'ibali has produced three) or more durable versions of the supplements.

Appropriateness

Adult usage of the supplement is high: adults both read the supplement themselves, and use it when engaging with children. When the supplement is used in organisations, child usage is high, with children using the supplement more than adults. In both households and organisations, older teenagers are the least likely to use the supplement.

With respect to reading materials, TBSs and TBPs indicated a preference for reading newspapers and magazines. Organisational respondents were more likely to prefer reading children's books with pictures, fiction books for adults, and the Nal'ibali bilingual reading supplements.

Quality

The vast majority (94%) of respondents who use the Nal'ibali supplement agree that "the stories in the Nal'ibali supplements are interesting", but the supplements are considered more interesting for younger children.

Feedback on the language choices of Nal'ibali was predominantly positive. Of the five languages surveyed, there were only three instances out of a total of 20 questions (four questions, five languages) when respondent disagreement was at, or above, 10% and of these only one related directly to language quality (as opposed to the language being similar to everyday language), namely:

• "The way isiXhosa is used is easy to understand": 12% negative (9% disagree, 3% strongly disagree).

Sesotho speakers were the most positive about Nal'ibali's language choices: out of the four questions related to language use, no respondent selected "strongly disagree". Sepedi and isiXhosa FGD participants gave some negative feedback regarding translation from English to Sepedi and the isiXhosa vocabulary being confusing. However, it was noted that these concerns apply to reading materials in general and not specifically to the Nalibali supplement. NSROs rated the Nal'ibali supplements slightly more highly than other reading materials for African language quality and use.

There are many, varied things that users like about the supplement and few things they dislike. FGD participants consider the supplements to be educational and fun.

Messaging

Some of Nal'ibali's key messages appear to have found fertile ground. Most survey respondents agreed that reading aloud to children was important and that reading to children would help them do better in school (over 95% for both questions), with SO respondents being more likely to strongly agree. Child FGD participants are avid readers, with many reporting reading three times a day: at school, at reading clubs, and at home. The general consensus among them was that their their parents should read with them every day.

However, the values and beliefs of respondents who reported being aware of, and using, the Nal'ibali supplements – and in the case of NSOs (reading clubs) attending training sessions – did not differ substantially from those who did not. It thus cannot be concluded that respondents have these values and beliefs because they are using the supplement or receiving support from Nal'ibali. However, there were some differences between SOs (which receive the greatest support from Nal'ibali) and organisations which receive less support (i.e. NSOs (readings clubs) and NSROs).

Key messages with lesser uptake are: the intrinsic value of reading for enjoyment and the value of reading in home languages: Most respondents agreed that helping children study is more important than reading to them, with Nal'ibali supplement users and SOs being *more* likely to agree with the statement.

The majority of respondents (55%) also agreed that it is more important for children to learn to read in English than their home language, but the majority of organisational respondents disagreed with the statement and SOs were most likely to disagree.

Overall, 85% of respondents indicated they preferred to read in English, greater than the 64% found by the 2016 National Reading Survey (SABDC, 2017). This may indicate a difference between opinion and practice in the respondents. Overwhelmingly TBSs and TBPs prefer to read in English (over 90%), however, fewer organisational respondents prefer reading in English - between 27% and 48% prefer to read in another language.

Cost-effectiveness

When considering the unit cost per supplement, newspaper is the most cost-effective distribution strategy at R1.61 per supplement. SAPO is the next cheapest at R2.11, and distribution by TB driver and courier are considerably more expensive (R3.02 and R4.00 respectively). However, it is important to consider that there is an additional delivery cost borne by the SAPO which is not known, AND there is likely to be an additional cost borne by SOs that collect the supplement from the SAPO.

TB covers 96% of the distribution cost for supplements distributed in newspapers so the distribution cost to Nal'ibali is less than 1 cent per supplement distributed in this way. Additional costs borne by organisations have unintended consequences, as the supplement may be delivered but not be collected.

When considering the unit cost per reader, distribution via SAPO is the most cost effective strategy at R3.00 per reader. The next most cost effective method is the newspaper at R3.53 per reader, followed by TB driver at R6.00 per reader. Courier is considerably more expensive at R21.88 per reader. It is not unexpected that distribution via courier is expensive because this strategy is used in remote areas, and should SOs receiving the supplement via courier be required to access their supplements via another modality, they would likely bear additional costs themselves.

Whilst the cost of delivering the supplements to organisations is higher, direct delivery strategies are well targeted with few supplements thrown away, and usage is more extensive (in terms of number of users, types of users, types of use and number of times the supplement is used) in organisations. However, even with these caveats, distribution via courier appears to be considerably more expensive and less effective than other strategies. One reason for this is that some organisations receive a very high number of supplements (i.e. up to 1700 copies). It is unlikely that an organisation could utilise such a large quantity of supplements without further distribution; however, these onward distribution strategies (and usage thereafter) are not known.

Conclusion and recommendations

Nal'ibali aims to reach people of all classes, races, and age groups. However, the primary target audience is adults who live and work with children, and who have the potential to be reading role models. The supplement appears to be reaching an appropriate target audience in that a significant proportion of survey respondents are adults with the capacity to influence children. The supplement is able to reach a diverse group of South Africans through current distribution channels. However, the differences in the demographics of the TBS population in particular demonstrate that Nal'ibali is not reaching everyone who is in most need of reading resource material and needs to hear the campaign messages. The survey respondents were, in general, more highly educated, less likely to be

unemployed, and had a better understanding of the importance of reading to children than other South Africans. Furthermore, as one of Nal'ibali's key messages is to encourage reading to children in their home language, there is an obvious disconnect with distribution in English newspapers.

Based on the findings and discussion which preceded this Chapter and feedback on presentations made, the evaluation team present the following recommendations for consideration by Nal'ibali.

Recommendations for awareness, targeting, and distribution

- Work to increase awareness of the supplement amongst TBSs and TBPs (for the latter particularly in the Eastern Cape), which will, in turn, lead to increased use.
- Use posters to raise the profile of Nal'ibali in post offices.
- Promotion at trainings, events and by word of mouth appear to be the most effective awareness raising strategies for Nal'ibali amongst organisations.
- Consider distributing the supplement via newspapers which are cheaper (particularly in Limpopo) and have a higher degree of parent/caregiver readership, as well as newspapers which are published in other languages as potential new distribution strategies which may enable the supplement and its associated messages to be extended to hard to reach groups who would benefit from it.
- Consider piloting the sale of the Nal'ibali supplement in supermarkets in Limpopo where close to half of all TBPs who were surveyed (47%) said they would buy the supplement if it were sold on its own.
- Clarify how organisations can become SOs. Consider a points ranking system which would favour organisations most in need and most deserving.
- Limit the number of supplements which an SO can receive; require a motivation (and evidence of use) from SOs which request a large number of copies.
- Monitor the collection of supplements by SOs from SAPOs and central distribution points. Nal'ibali should
 maintain up-to-date contact information not just for SOs that the supplement is delivered to, but also
 for SOs which receive the supplement from a SAPO or central distribution point and contact all SOs
 regularly to confirm that they are still receiving and using the supplement and want to remain receiving
 it regularly.
- Improve communication between Nal'ibali and central distribution points.
- Identify a supplement coordinator at every SAPO that the supplement is delivered to and collected from.
- Delivery to post offices (with collection by SOs) appears to be a cost-effective delivery mechanism, but there needs to be careful monitoring and feedback as the pilot initiated in 2017 scales.
- On the other hand, delivery via courier is the most expensive and least cost-effective in terms of cost per supplement and cost per reader – three and a half times more expensive in terms of cost-per reader than the next most expensive delivery strategy. Consider more cost-efficient alternatives, keeping in mind that if the supplement is no longer delivered directly to SOs in hard-to-reach areas, SOs are likely to be required to foot some of the distribution costs.

Recommendations for content and use

- The format of the supplement, varied content and types of stories produced are greatly appreciated, well-liked and well–used. The supplement should be retained in its current format and content.
- However, consider a redesign of page one in light of the feedback from survey respondents and focus
 group participants around usage (this was the least used section of the supplement). Content could be
 revised to be more enticing and engaging in an effort to increase overall awareness of the supplement,
 increase use, and maximise available space.
- Consider making anthologies (of which Nal'ibali has produced three) available to organisations where story use (and reuse) is high.
- Give more consideration to commissioning stories in other South African languages and translating them
 into English. This will preserve the authentic use of African languages, and improve the literary culture
 from the ground up and from the top down.
- Consider training on the use of the supplements with individuals (not specifically linked to organisations),
 either through a new channel of engagement or through a revision of existing channels. The FUNda Leader is one option to intensify training and messaging around the use of the supplement with children.

Recommendations for messaging

- Consider consolidating and revising messaging to focus efforts around engagement with children.
- Carry messaging more concertedly through stories and other aspects of the supplement, as well as through redesigning page one.
- Consider that there may be misinterpretation of messaging, which may be conflated by presentation of
 messages regarding of reading for fun as a socio-cultural and personal or family bonding activity, and the
 concurrent presentation of the benefits of reading for fun on scholastic achievement. This may in part
 explain the high percentages of all sub-groups who felt that it was more important to help children study
 than to read to them (for further information see Chapter 7).

Recommendations for further investigation/research

- Monitor the rollout of the SAPO as a collection point distribution strategy. This study collected limited information, and a more in-depth assessment is recommended.
- Monitor the collection of supplements after they have been delivered to distribution points. Monitoring should be on continuous basis with a more in-depth investigation conducted periodically.
- Conduct research to identify suitable newspapers which are cheaper, have a high degree of parent/caregiver readership, and newspapers published in other languages as potential new distribution strategies.
- Investigate the reasons why individuals prefer reading in English. Reading in a home language may be valued only as a bridge to reading in English. Further research could elucidate the reasons why this may be the case.

- Consider developing benchmarks and targets regarding awareness (% awareness), targeting (% supplements delivered to target groups), access (% target groups reached) and use (# users, types of use) linked to Nal'ibali's theory of change and monitor progress irt these.
- Utilise the survey findings as a benchmark for future studies, particularly with respect to data collected which relates to Nal'ibali's Theory of Change (ToC) and the groups (TBS, SOs and NSOs [reading clubs]), for which population or probability samples were drawn.
- Consider verifying self-reported findings regarding supplement use (users, frequency and types of use) via a qualitative in-depth study involving selected SOs.